Professional Judgment: Did You Know?

Kim Wells | October 2018
U.S. Department of Education
IASFAA Conference

Agenda

- Professional Judgment Overview
- Adjusting Cost of Attendance
- Adjusting EFC Data Elements
- Adjusting COA vs. EFC elements
- Performing a Dependency Override
- Parent Refusal to Complete FAFSA and Provide Support
- Denying or Reducing Direct Loans
What is Professional Judgment?

• The term “professional judgment” can be found in the Code of Federal Regulations, but there are no regulations for the practice.

• The law does not use the term “professional judgment”.
  - The Higher Education Act refers to the financial aid administrator’s authority to make adjustments, on the basis of documentation, to allow for treatment of an individual with special circumstances.
What is Professional Judgment?

**HEA Sec. 479A(a) IN GENERAL** — *Nothing in this part shall be interpreted as limiting the authority of the financial aid administrator, on the basis of adequate documentation, to make adjustments on a case-by-case basis to the cost of attendance or the values of the data items required to calculate the expected student or parent contribution (or both) to allow for treatment of an individual eligible applicant with special circumstances* 

What Professional Judgment is Not

• What a professional judgment cannot be used for:
  • A professional judgment is award year specific and cannot carry forward from year to year unless subsequent requests are made and subsequent documentation obtained
  • You cannot directly change an EFC
  • You cannot make changes to the EFC formula
  • You may not establish automatic categories of special circumstances and provide identical outcomes to all students in that circumstance
  • All professional judgments must be conducted on a case by case basis
What Professional Judgment is Not

• What a professional judgment cannot be used for (cont.):
  • You must not use a professional judgment to circumvent the regulations or the law
  • You must not use professional judgment to waive student eligibility requirements
  • You cannot use a professional judgment to make an otherwise independent student dependent
  • Dependency overrides, as we’ll discuss later, is a one-way option from dependent to independent
  • You may not make a dependent student independent based solely on the student’s demonstrated self-sufficiency

Professional Judgment Documentation

The Higher Education Act uses the phrase, “on the basis of adequate documentation.” While the Department of Education does not define adequate documentation, the documentation should be such that an auditor or program reviewer must be able to gain understanding from the documentation. Documentation should also be such that the institution has satisfied itself in the belief that proper action has been taken.
Professional Judgment Documentation

Documentation considerations:

- Should be “adequate and reasonable”
- Use third-party documentation when possible
- Can never have too much documentation
- Remain flexible on documentation types

Professional Judgment is a Choice

- Exercising Professional Judgment is at the discretion of the school and is a matter of policy
- It is within a school’s right to refuse a professional judgment as a matter of policy
- If a school decides to conduct a professional judgment, a policy must be in place
- A school is not obligated to exercise a professional judgment for a student if conducted at another school
Professional Judgment & Verification

- If a student is selected for verification, the verification process must be complete before exercising a professional judgment.
- The results of the verification and professional judgment cannot be submitted on the same day.
- After the school receives the ISIR resulting from verification, the school would use the resulting ISIR transaction to make adjustments for the professional judgment.

Cost of Attendance Adjustments

HEA Sec. 479A(a)

"Nothing in this part shall be interpreted as limiting the authority of the financial aid administrator, on the basis of adequate documentation, to make adjustments on a case by case basis to the cost of attendance. . . to allow for treatment of an individual eligible applicant with special circumstances."
Cost of Attendance Adjustments

Each cost of attendance component for a student is an estimate of the student’s educational expenses. Typically, most schools use average costs rather than actual expenses. Financial aid administrators are given the latitude to adjust any of these components on a case-by-case basis to allow for special circumstances.

Cost of Attendance Elements

- Tuition
- Fees
- Books
- Supplies
- Transportation
- Miscellaneous Personal Expenses
- Room and Board
- Dependent Care
- Licensure Costs
- Costs associated with Study Abroad
- Disability related expenses
EFC Data Element Adjustments

HEA Sec. 479A(a)
“Nothing in this part shall be interpreted as limiting the authority of the financial aid administrator, on the basis of adequate documentation, to make adjustments on a case by case basis . . . to the values of the data items required to calculate the expected student or parent contribution (or both) to allow for treatment of an individual eligible applicant with special circumstances.”

Adjust EFC Data Elements

• This type of professional judgment gives the FAA the latitude to modify one, or more, of the data elements listed on the FAFSA® which are used in the EFC formula
• It is important that the school choose an element and value that is appropriate to the student’s special circumstances
  • Understanding the EFC formula, as described in the AVG Chapter 3, can help the FAA make a more appropriate decision
IRA Roth Conversions

- When converting a regular IRA into a Roth IRA by transferring funds, the amount converted has to be reported as taxable income.
- This results in a higher income reported on the FAFSA, even though the family doesn’t have additional income or assets available.
- Schools can use PJ to adjust the income and taxes as though there was no Roth conversion.
- Schools are not required to perform this type of PJ.
Unemployment Benefits

- DCLs GEN 09-04 & GEN 09-05: Use of Professional Judgment by Financial Aid Administrations
  - Unemployment benefits can be reduced to zero as ED, in consultation with the Dept. of Labor and OMB, have determined the maximum benefit will not have a significant impact on the EFC for an Independent Student
  - If other family members are receiving unemployment benefits, schools are encouraged to examine the family’s economic situation and make appropriate adjustments

*GEN 11-04 clarifies that these DCLs are still in effect*

Unemployment Benefits (cont.)

- Documentation: Letters for unemployment insurance issuance from state unemployment agencies can be used for up to 90 days from date of issue
- Documentation: Other verification of current receipt of unemployment benefits is an acceptable substitute for the state unemployment agency letter
- Schools should make an effort to determine if the student or family member is still unemployed before applying this provision
Prior-Prior Year Data

- When making an adjustment to income data elements, a school can use any 12 month period that it determines best demonstrates the family’s financial strength.
- If satisfactory documentation is obtained, 12 month periods may include, but are not limited to:
  - Prior year income data
  - Past 12 months income data from time of request
  - Anticipated income data for the financial aid award year
  - Anticipated income data for the current calendar year

Income Protection Allowance (IPA)
Income Protection Allowance (IPA)

• Understanding the Income Protection Allowance (IPA) in the EFC formula can be helpful in adjusting an EFC data element
• The IPA is an allowance value in the EFC formula that directly reduces the AGI
• A school can determine the IPA by reviewing page three of the student’s ISIR under Intermediate Values
  • It is the value labeled IPA

Income Protection Allowance (IPA)

• IPA element breakdown is as follows:
  • 30% for food
  • 22% for housing
  • 9% for transportation
  • 16% for clothing and personal care
  • 11% for medical expenses
  • 12% for other family consumption
Income Protection Allowance (IPA)

Example:
Knowing that a student has an IPA of $7,780, you can determine that the formula took into account $856 for medical expenses (11% of $7,780). If a student provides documentation that $2,856 will be spent on out of pocket medical expenses, you have the ability to adjust either the AGI or taxes paid for the difference of $2,000.

Adjusting COA Versus EFC Data Elements
Adjusting COA vs. EFC Data Elements

Adjusting COA: Generally, when making an upward adjustment of a COA element, the intent is to **potentially** increase the student’s need based and/or non-need based aid eligibility

- Since COA does not often alter the amount of Federal Pell, there is typically no change in the amount of Pell a student will receive under a COA adjustment

---

Adjusting COA to Affect Eligibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COA Prior to PJ</th>
<th>Award</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tuition/Fees: $7,200</td>
<td>COA $16,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books/Supplies: $1,300</td>
<td>EFC $7,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation: $1,080</td>
<td>Need Based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Expenses: $900</td>
<td>Scholarship $7,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Room/Board: $5,820</td>
<td>DL Unsub $3,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total: $16,300</td>
<td>DL Sub $1,600 PLUS $3,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$9,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$7,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-Need Based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$9,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Aid: $16,300</td>
<td>$7,200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Adjusting COA to Affect Eligibility

**$1700 Adjustment to COA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COA After PJ</th>
<th>Award</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tuition/Fees: $7,200</td>
<td>COA $18,000↑ Need = $10,800↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books/Supplies: $1,300</td>
<td>EFC $7,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation: $1,080</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Expenses: $2,600</td>
<td>Need Based Scholarship $7500  DL Unsub $2200↓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Room/Board: $5,820</td>
<td>Non-Need Based DL Sub $3300↑ PLUS $5000↑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total: $18,000↑</td>
<td>$10800</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Aid:** $18,000

### Adjusting COA vs. EFC Data Elements

**Adjusting EFC Data Elements:** Generally, when adjusting EFC Data elements, the intent is to lower the EFC to potentially increase Pell eligibility and/or other need-based aid.
## Adjusting EFC to Affect Eligibility

### Award Prior to EFC Adjustment

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COA</td>
<td>$16,300</td>
<td>Need = $10,300</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFC</td>
<td>$6,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need Based</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholarship</td>
<td>$7,500</td>
<td>DL Unsub</td>
<td>$2,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL Sub</td>
<td>$2,800</td>
<td>PLUS</td>
<td>$3,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$10,300</td>
<td></td>
<td>$6,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Aid: $16,300

### Award After EFC Adjustment

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>COA</td>
<td>$16,300</td>
<td>Need = $12,100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFC</td>
<td>$4,200</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need Based</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pell</td>
<td>$1,770*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scholarship</td>
<td>$7,500</td>
<td>DL Unsub</td>
<td>$2,670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL Sub</td>
<td>$2,830</td>
<td>PLUS</td>
<td>$1,530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$12,100</td>
<td></td>
<td>$4,200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Aid Eligibility = $16,300


Dependency Override

HEA Sec. 480(d)(7)
States that a student who does not qualify as an “independent student” in one or more of the 13 categories, as defined in Step 3 of the FAFSA, may be considered an independent student if he or she; . . . is a student for whom a financial aid administrator makes a determination of independence by reason of other unusual circumstances.

Dependency Override

Section 480(d)(7) provides the financial aid administrator with great latitude in determining what constitutes unusual circumstances.
However, in accordance with DCL GEN 03-07, there are four identified conditions that individually, or in combination, do not merit unusual circumstance.
Dependency Override (GEN 03-07)

For purposes of dependency override, the following conditions do not merit unusual circumstance:

• Parents refusing to contribute to the student’s education;
• Parents unwilling to provide information on the application or for verification;
• Parents not claiming the student as a dependent for income tax purposes;
• Students demonstrating total self-sufficiency
• Parents live separately from student or in a foreign country (GEN 11-15)

Dependency Override

• GEN 03-07 further recognizes that unusual circumstances could include an abusive family environment or abandonment by parents
• GEN 11-15 provides examples as it relates to a family crisis or unlawful act wherein a dependency override might be considered
Parent Refusal to Complete FAFSA & Provide Support

HEA Sec. 479A(a)
“... In addition, nothing in this title shall be interpreted as limiting the authority of the student financial aid administrator ... to offer a dependent student financial assistance under section 428H or a Federal Direct Unsubsidized Stafford Loan without requiring the parents of such student to file the financial aid form prescribed under sections 482 if the student financial aid administrator verifies that the parent or parents of such student have ended financial support of such student and refuse to file such form.”

Parental Refusal

Prior to introducing this new category of PJ, a student whose parents refused to complete the FAFSA and refused to provide financial support would be ineligible for any Title IV student aid. With this provision in place, the school can now exercise professional judgment and make the student, in this situation, eligible for a Dependent Level Unsubsidized Direct Loan ONLY.
Parental Refusal to Complete FAFSA/Support

- Provision does not act as a dependency override. The student under this provision is still a dependent student.
- A non-custodial parent may still borrow a PLUS loan and the student would still be eligible for this provision.
- If parents are unwilling to sign a statement the school must obtain confirmation/information from a third-party.

For documentation purposes, the custodial parent (if not married) or both parents (if married) must sign a statement indicating a refusal to provide both support and the FAFSA data.

Denying or Reducing Direct Loans

34 CFR 685.301(a)(8)

(8) A school may refuse to originate a Direct Subsidized, Direct Unsubsidized, or Direct PLUS Loan or may reduce the borrower’s determination of need for the loan if the reason for that action is documented and provided to the borrower in writing, and if:

(i) The determination is made on a case-by-case basis;

(ii) The documentation supporting the determination is retained in the student’s file; and

(iii) The school does not engage in any pattern or practice that results in a denial of a borrower’s access to Direct Loans because of the borrower’s race, gender, color, religion, national origin, age, disability status, or income.
Denying or Reducing Direct Loans

If the reason is documented and provided to the borrower in writing:

• A school has the option to refuse to originate
  • Direct Subsidized Loan
  • Direct Unsubsidized Loan
  • PLUS Loan
• May reduce the borrower’s determination of need for the loan
  • Originate a loan for less than what the borrower would otherwise be eligible to receive

Denying or Reducing Direct Loans

• The denial or reduction of the loan can be done if:
  • The determination is made on a case by case basis
  • The school provides the reason to the student in writing
  • The documentation supporting the determination is retained in the student’s file and
  • The school does not engage in any pattern or practice that results in a denial of a borrower’s access to Direct Loans because of the borrower’s race, gender, color, religion, national origin, age, disability status, or income
Resources

**Federal Student Aid Handbook**
Application and Verification Guide CH. 5

**Federal Regulations** – 34 CFR
685.301(a)(8) Denying or Reducing Direct Loans

**Higher Education Act (HEA)**
HEA Sec. 479A General
HEA Sec. 480(d)(7) Dependency Override
Resources (Cont.)

Dear Colleague Letters

GEN 03-07  Dependency Overrides
GEN 11-15  Dependency Overrides
GEN 08-12  Parent Refusal to Provide FAFSA Data & Support
GEN 09-04  PJ & Family Financial Circumstances
GEN 09-05  PJ for Unemployment Benefits
GEN 11-04  PJ & Combat Pay Reminder; Extends 09-04 & 09-05
GEN 11-07  Denying or Reducing a Direct Loan
GEN 16-03  Prior-Prior Year and Professional Judgment

Contact Information

Virginia Hagins, Training Officer
virginia.w.hagins@ed.gov | (415) 269-3515
Training Feedback

To ensure quality training we ask all participants to please fill out an online session evaluation

https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/KimberlyWells

• Evaluation form is specific to Kim Wells
• Feedback tool provides means to educate and inform areas for improvement and support an effective process for listening to our customers
• Additional feedback about training can be directed to mark.gerhard@ed.gov
Thank You!